Interactive comment on “Validation metrics for ice edge position forecasts” by Arne Melsom et al.

Dukhovskoy
ddukhovskoy@fsu.edu

Received and published: 24 January 2019

Formulae for Hausdorff distance and Modified Hausdorff distance have to be given. Eq. 7 is not complete, I couldn’t find definitions of d0 and dm in the text. Please give an exact formula for HD that was used. I would strongly discourage using "extreme ice edge displacement" as a synonym for any of the Hausdorff distances. These are not the same. Extreme ice edge displacement is a separate metric based on the norm defined as max|dist(a,b)|, which has nothing to do with the HD or MHD. Please, do not confuse the readers. My understanding is that neither MHD nor HD has been really tested in this exercise, this should be stated in the document. In the text: "In our formulation, this quantity is the maximum of the two terms in the bracket in Eq. 5, and will generally exhibit similar results to DIE AV G but with larger magnitudes." From what I see, Eq.5 is not MHD.