Interactive comment on “A discussion on the use of X-band SAR images in marine applications” by D. Schiavulli et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 29 November 2012

General comments: This paper is presented as a ‘discussion’ on the use of X-band SAR for marine applications and presents no original research of its own. It should therefore be evaluated as a review-paper. However, the manuscript in its present form is not nearly comprehensive enough to be accepted as a review-paper. Instead of reviewing the possible marine applications of X-band data the paper is concentrated on reviewing a subset of issues affecting image quality (rain cells and scalloping). It is difficult to imagine what the target audience for this review-paper could be as it contains no new information for a SAR-expert, but on the other hand it does not give a complete review of marine applications or issues affecting image quality either. Even though the discussion concentrates on image-quality, the reader is not presented with any example images that would help a non-expert reader to understand what is being talked about.
For comparison, a comprehensive treatment of issues affecting SAR image quality over the sea can be found in the "Synthetic Aperture Radar Marine User's Manual" that is also available on the web at:
http://www.sarusersmanual.com/

Similarly for comparison, a good review presentation of the marine applications of SAR data can be found for example in:

Interactive comment on Ocean Sci. Discuss., 9, 3239, 2012.