**Interactive comment on “Coastal upwelling along the southwest coast of India – ENSOmodulation”**

*by K. Muni Krishna*

**Anonymous Referee #1**

Received and published: 28 April 2008

**Resume**

From the well-known facts that ENSO modulates the Indian Monsoon, and that the Monsoon impacts coastal upwelling along the south Indian coast, the author hypothesizes that there should be an ENSO-upwelling teleconnection. As upwelling impacts fisheries this would be important to know. The anticipated time-lag would imply some form of predictability. He then tests his hypothesis by correlating an ENSO index with SST anomalies (SSTA) of the south-west Indoan coast and finds that indeed ENSO is a good predictor for SSTA off the Indian coast a few months later.

The paper is short and concisely written and contains all necessary information. Unfortunately, it also contains a major methodological flaw. When assessing the hind-
cast skill (p. 127) for the years 1997/98 and 1989/99, the author uses a regression that has been derived from the period 1960-2003, i.e., in which the years to be tested are included. This is thus no independent test. The test must be repeated with the two years to be tested removed from the period over which the relation is derived.

**Recommendation**

My recommendation is therefore *accept with major revision*, and contingent on the positive result being confirmed by the revised test.

**Typos etc**

Numbers denote page/line numbers.

125/15: AS -> As
126/21: off southwest coast"-> of the southwest coast; this error occurs all over the place.
126/21: indicating -> indicate
126/23: also good -> also a good
128/1: relaxed -> reduced
128/26: modulated -> modulate

Figure 2: "bold" and "dot" must be reversed in the legend; it would be helpful to have the regression and/or correlation values added.

Interactive comment on Ocean Sci. Discuss., 5, 123, 2008.